



West  
Yorkshire  
Combined  
Authority

Tracy  
Brabin  
Mayor of  
West Yorkshire

## **TRANSPORT & INFRASTRUCTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**MEETING TO BE HELD AT 10.00 AM ON FRIDAY 1 DECEMBER 2023  
IN CONFERENCE ROOM 1/2, WELLINGTON HOUSE, 40-50  
WELLINGTON STREET, LEEDS, LS1 2DE**

---

### **A G E N D A**

Please note that this meeting will be filmed for live or subsequent broadcast via the Combined Authority's internet site. At the start of the meeting the Chair will confirm if all or part of the meeting is being filmed. Generally, the public seating areas will not be filmed; however, by entering the meeting room and using the public seating area, you are consenting to being filmed and to the possible use of those images and sound recordings for webcasting. If you have any queries regarding this, please contact Governance Services on 0113 251 7220.

- 1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**  
To note apologies for absence and confirm the quorum of 11 members is met.
- 2. DECLARATIONS OF DISCLOSABLE PECUNIARY INTERESTS**
- 3. POSSIBLE EXCLUSION OF THE PRESS AND PUBLIC**
- 4. MINUTES OF THE LAST MEETING HELD ON 29 SEPTEMBER 2023**  
(Pages 1 - 8)
- 5. CHAIR'S COMMENTS AND UPDATE**
- 6. MAYORS QUESTION TIME - TRACY BRABIN**  
(Pages 9 - 20)
- 7. WORK PROGRAMME**  
(Pages 21 - 32)
- 8. DATE OF THE NEXT MEETING - 26 JANUARY 2024**

**Signed:**



**Chief Executive  
West Yorkshire Combined Authority**



## MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE TRANSPORT & INFRASTRUCTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE HELD ON FRIDAY 29 SEPTEMBER 2023 IN CONFERENCE ROOMS 1/2, WELLINGTON HOUSE, 40-50 WELLINGTON STREET, LEEDS, LS1 2DE

---

### Present:

Cllr Joanne Dodds	Bradford Council
Cllr Anna Watson	Bradford Council
Cllr Joe Atkinson	Calderdale Council
Cllr Amanda Parsons-Hulse (Chair)	Calderdale Council
Cllr Dot Foster	Calderdale Council
Cllr Harry McCarthy	Kirklees Council
Cllr Andrew Pinnock	Kirklees Council
Cllr Oliver Newton	Leeds City Council
Cllr Kayleigh Brooks	Leeds City Council
Cllr Izaak Wilson	Leeds City Council
Cllr Dave Merrett	York City Council

### In attendance:

Hannah Scales	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Khaled Berroum	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Mick Bunting	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Simon Warburton	West Yorkshire Combined Authority

### 1. Apologies for absence

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Sabiya Khan, Charlie Keith, Mark Thompson, and Tony Hames.

The meeting was quorate, with 11 members present out of 11 needed for quorum.

### 2. Declarations of Disclosable Pecuniary Interests

There were no declarations of disclosable pecuniary interests.

Cllr Dave Merrett declared a non-pecuniary interest as a member of the Northern Transport Activists Roundtable, York Bus Forum & as a concessionary bus pass user.

### 3. Possible exclusion of the press and public

There were no items requiring the exclusion of the press and public.

#### **4. Minutes of the meeting held on 9 March 2023**

**Resolved:** That the minutes of the meeting held on 9 March 2023 be approved subject to the addition of Cllr Harry McCarthy to the attendance list, as he was present.

#### **5. Chair's comments and update**

The Chair welcomed new and returning members to the Committee and:

- Provided a reminder about the challenges with quoracy and the need to keep scrutiny officers informed of attendance so substitutes could be arranged in good time.
- Emphasised the importance of keeping discussions at a strategic and regionally focused level, rather than too focused at ward/local council level, which is more typical in local scrutiny.
- Update the committee that she met with the Mayor, Chief Executive, Directors, and the Chair of Transport Committee to inform them of the committee's work programme and discuss the live issues in the transport sector.

The Chair also thanked the Scrutiny Support Officer Hannah Scales for her support throughout the years and wished well in her new role, as this would be her last meeting.

**Resolved:** That the Chair's verbal update be noted.

#### **6. Scrutiny and Governance Arrangements**

The Statutory Scrutiny Officer presented a report providing an overview of the governance and scrutiny arrangements established by the Combined Authority at its annual meeting.

It was noted that the Mayor's Question Time was now scheduled to take place on 1 December 2023 instead of the usual January time due to diary constraints.

**Resolved:** That the scrutiny and governance arrangements are noted.

#### **7. Transport & Infrastructure Scrutiny Work Programme**

The Statutory Scrutiny Officer presented a report providing an overview of the work programme agreed by members over the summer period, following the work planning session held in July.

The Committee agreed:

- To establish a working group to investigate the Flexi Bus scheme, focusing on an overview of the scheme itself and its goals, its performance and why it was cancelled, and determine who made the decision to cancel the scheme – before reporting back to a future

meeting as appropriate. The following members volunteered to participate:

- Cllr Amanda Parsons-Hulse
- Cllr Andrew Pinnock
- Cllr Dot Foster
- Cllr Anna Watson
- Cllr Dave Merrett

- That once the Bus Franchising and Mass Transit schemes had progressed to delivery stage, the Committee should set up two permanent working groups to shadow and scrutinise the projects – possibly in 2024.
- The Mayor’s Housing Pledge is best covered during the Mayors Question Time session with her on 1 December, and that the sustainability and carbon footprint of housebuilding be added to the discussion.

**Resolved:**

- i) That the work programme be adopted as amended.
- ii) That a Flexi Bus working group be established to:
  1. be provided with an overview of the scheme and its goals.
  2. assess its performance and the reason for its cancellation.
  3. determine who made the decision to cancel the scheme and why it was not a Member or key decision.

**8. Bus Reform & Improvement**

The Executive Director for Transport provided a report summarising the latest passenger experience and transport network data and the latest performance update of the Bus Service Improvement Plan (BSIP) – in addition to a verbal update on the Combined Authority’s decision to begin the process of formally pursuing Bus Franchising (taken the previous day) and the next steps.

In terms of **Bus Franchising:**

- The Combined Authority agreed on 28 September to begin the statutory process for bus franchising, following an independent evaluation by Grant Thornton.
- The consultation will begin on 10 October 2023 and all the documentation, including the independent evaluation, will be published for the public and members to see.
- The consultation will run until 7 January 2024 and assessed by an external agency independently and a report will be submitted to the March meeting of the Combined Authority for final approval.
- If approved in March 2024, the timeline for the implementation of franchising long term is planned to take place in three rounds over several years, focusing on different locations and maximising resource use.
- The first round of contracts will be let in Q2 of 2026 to start delivery in 2027. The second round of contracts will be in Q1 2027 to begin by

the end of 2027. The third round of contracts will be at the end of 2027 to be operation by Summer 2028.

- Some issues are still outstanding, such as management and ownership of bus depots – currently in private hands.
- It is a lengthy process involving significant public contracts and funds, and complicated legalities and planning, with numerous stages of preparation and engagement.
- It is vital that members, and the public, are briefed regularly and kept in the loop as the process develops and additional deeper briefings are planned.

The Committee discussed the long-term plans to transition to a bus franchising model and the short-term plans to improve bus services in the interim while that is pursued.

The main points of discussion were:

- **Passenger feedback and complaints:** Discussions around the Passenger Charter revealed that most passengers don't know they can complain or how to complain, therefore data around confidence in the system is incomplete without better advertising for the ways passengers can feedback. Roadside displays (RSDs), and tickets, are considered a key place that complaint information can be advertised widely to ensure that people's views are taken on board – including complaint information to passenger charities in addition to Metroline, a WYCA-managed customer service line which logs all complaints, even those forwarded to other operators.
- **Roadside displays (RSDs):** Due to how RSDs work and are affected by weather, only one document can be displayed at once so all information including bus times and complaints etc must fit on one sheet. Despite a directive issued by the Transport Committee to maintain RSDs after they were deprioritised during COVID, work to update RSDs has been delayed due to a number of factors, including: the volume of requests (over 74,000 across the region) and issues at the printing facilities and distribution. Limit of 6 times a year that bus operators can change timetables, so that they can be reflected in RSDs and limit the number of changes needed.
- **Paper tickets and printed content:** Paper tickets – and other printed content – are still a commitment for the foreseeable future, as many people still rely on them, but long-term next generation digital solutions are also being developed alongside them for the future.
- **Transport funding complications:** Transport funding at WYCA is relatively complicated as it comes from multiple sources and pots, which each have their own stipulations and review arrangements, and which cannot be transferred or redeployed across transport projects and services when certain areas struggle more than other areas. Moving to a deeper devolution model, as planned by the central government, which includes more flexible and devolved single-pot

funding arrangements would support a more flexible and autonomous approach to budget management.

- **Mayors Fares:** One example is the Mayors Fares programme, a flagship mayoral ambition, which was allocated £33m and is reported to be spending that money ahead of schedule due to various factors such as cost inflation for the scheme itself and pressures on bus companies who are seeking to renegotiate going forward – as permitted in the original contract. A report will be submitted to the Combined Authority soon to update them on the latest financial position of Mayors Fares, which the Committee also requested to see when complete.
- **BSIP and protected bus services:** The most common feedback during consultation is that BSIP money should be used to protect at-risk services and cover lost routes. BSIP money has been used to protect 56 services; 30 were full services that would otherwise have been withdrawn and 26 were contract uplifts which covered the parts the less profitable elements of otherwise profitable services, e.g. mid-day or late/early services. Members reported that they were unaware of these protected services and suggested it be communicated and marketed to residents more clearly and widely, as a success, and officers offered to provide a breakdown of the protected services for any interested Member. In addition, it was reported that the committee could see a further breakdown of some of the BSIP funding.
- **Bus services/route issues and feedback:** Members reported that their constituents have reported a “gradual chipping away” of services, particularly the earlier and later services and mid-day frequency. The services and timetables seem to fit less and less with people’s habits and needs and people feel ignored by the bus operators during consultations – especially on Park and Ride schemes which are reducing services, operating times, and increasing ticket prices, which in one case led to the existence of an incentive ticket for a service that doesn’t exist (past 8pm). This has a higher impact on shift workers, such as NHS staff, who work irregular hours. WYCA does engage in regular discussion and consultation with the operators to fix timetable issues as described, but officers can only raise issues they are aware of and encourage Members and constituents to let officers know of issues so they can be factored into their thinking and solutions. A review is currently ongoing regarding school bus services.
- **Bus punctuality and other KPIs/targets:** Punctuality is less than 80%, less than in April when last reported, and doesn’t seem to be improving at any rate according to most recent data. Reliability is integral to improving bus patronage, which is a major ambition in the transport strategy and BSIP – with one goal being 11m journeys, from the current 4.5m. It was made clear that the ambition bus patronage number was a target and not a prediction, and that it was the

Authority shouldn't shy away from higher targets which are based on what the region needs in terms of modal shift. Although it was admitted that some of the targets marked as 90% (information and personal safety satisfaction) should be 100% under the same principle. These ambitious targets are now being worked on through new powers around franchising and major projects such as Mass Transit, designed to give West Yorkshire residents 'London-style' options – in addition to leveraging other devolved powers in policing and refurbishment funds to ensure that bus stations are more welcoming and safer. Modelling and data analysis is a major component of the bus franchising and mass transit work going forward as service and route design is dependent on information. The Committee also requested to see the 2023 KPI figures in future.

- **Travel Plan Network:** There are plans to revive the Travel Plan Network approach to engaging with employers to encourage public transport use, recognising that employers have a major impact on transport use in what they demand of their employees, such as hours worked, locations worked, home working, with as much as 1 in 5 journeys being to/from work. It was reported by Members that the Head of Net Zero at Yorkshire and Humber NHS is pursuing integrating bus information in their internal network to encourage staff to use them, which was welcomed by officers as a lead to follow up on, as the NHS is one of the region's biggest employers with Leeds General Infirmary alone employing over 28,000 people.
- **Real Time Information system (RTI):** An update was requested on the RTI system updates scrutinised by the Committee last year. It was confirmed that funding has been made available to pursue a 'deep dive' review of the system, with the help of focus groups of technical and bus operator partners, to iron out some of the issues previously seen. The system is only as good as the data and information going into it – the greater the data, the more accurate the information to eliminate 'ghost buses' and other issues, and the more easier it is for planners to plan timetable changes.
- **Connectivity and modes:** Buses are often only one mode in a longer journey made up of different modes, such as walking, rail or driving to park, and sometimes a journey involves two different bus companies' services which are not coordinated. Currently two private companies cannot be compelled to cooperate, but under franchising plans the Combined Authority will be able to set routes and design them with other modes in mind. For Bus Franchising and Mass Transit infrastructure, the goal is to have an interconnected transport network that takes all modes into account, including relatively new/future ones such as e-bikes (known as 'micro-mobility'). One related suggestion in the meantime was that WYCA should liaise with York Council, which has a metro centre and information catered to visitors with no knowledge of the local transport network and options, such as rental bikes, buses, and other options.



- **Decarbonisation goals:** Transport is a major carbon emitter and decarbonisation is a major lever in achieving zero carbon goals, with the latest data suggesting authorities are not on track to achieve any of the carbon pathways previously presented, with some past data presented to the committee last year even suggesting that for many transport schemes carbon emissions went up instead of down. Members want to be assured that the data and targets are correct, and authorities do not spend precious time and resources possibly going in the wrong direction by pursuing policies and projects that are not making an impact. It was confirmed that officers are still awaiting the publication of a toolkit for carbon measurement/analysis by the government which will be used across the whole country and all schemes to monitor and map out carbon reduction – it is still expected ahead of the planned Transport Plan 4 (LTP4) refresh.

**Resolved:** That the report be noted, and the Committee's comments and feedback be taken on board.

This page is intentionally left blank

<b>Report to:</b>	Transport and Infrastructure Scrutiny Committee
<b>Date:</b>	1 December 2023
<b>Subject:</b>	<b>Mayors Question Time</b>
<b>Director:</b>	Alan Reiss, Chief Operating Officer
<b>Author:</b>	Khaled Berroum, Statutory Scrutiny Officer

## 1. Purpose of this report

1.1 To introduce the Mayor's Question Time session.

## 2. Information

2.1 Every year the Mayor of West Yorkshire is invited to each of the Combined Authority's scrutiny committees at least once to answer the Committee's questions, on any matter related to that committee's remit, in a public setting.

2.2 It is an opportunity for Scrutiny Members to hold the Mayor directly to account for the policies they adopt, the money they spend, the decisions they make, the services they are delivering and the outcomes they are achieving for the people of West Yorkshire.

2.3 This year the Mayor is scheduled to attend the following Mayor's Question Times at scrutiny committees:

Date	Committee	Time	Location
1 December 2023	Transport & Infrastructure Scrutiny	10am	Wellington House, Leeds
12 January 2024	Economy Scrutiny	10am	Wellington House, Leeds
19 January 2024	Corporate Scrutiny	11.30am (TBC)	Wellington House, Leeds

2.4 The Mayor is permitted to invite relevant senior officers of the Combined Authority – such as the Chief Executive or a relevant Director – to join them at the session.

2.5 The session is divided into sections, each with a topic heading, which members can ask related questions on; every member will have the opportunity to speak and ask follow-up questions to their original question.

2.6 The minutes of the previous Mayors Question Time sessions at the Transport & Infrastructure Scrutiny Committee, which took place on 20 January 2022 and 19 January 2023, are attached as **Appendices 1 and 2** for reference.

### **3. Tackling the Climate Emergency Implications**

3.1 There are no climate emergency implications directly arising from this report.

### **4. Inclusive Growth Implications**

4.1 There are no inclusive growth implications directly arising from this report.

### **5. Equality and Diversity Implications**

5.1 There are no equality and diversity implications directly arising from this report.

### **6. Financial Implications**

6.1 There are no financial implications directly arising from this report.

### **7. Legal Implications**

7.1 There are no legal implications directly arising from this report.

### **8. Staffing Implications**

8.1 There are no staffing implications directly arising from this report.

### **9. External Consultees**

9.1 No external consultations have been undertaken.

### **10. Recommendations**

10.1 To question the Mayor of West Yorkshire, Tracy Brabin, on matters pertaining to the remit of the Economy Scrutiny Committee.

### **11. Background Documents**

There are no background documents referenced in this report.

### **12. Appendices**

Appendix 1 – Notes: Transport Scrutiny Mayors Question Time – 20 January 2023

Appendix 2 – Minutes: Transport and Infrastructure Scrutiny Mayors Question Time – 19 January 2023

## Notes of **Informal Consultative Meeting** of the Transport Scrutiny Committee (Mayor's Question Time) Meeting held on 20 January 2022 via Zoom

-----

### Item 1 – Welcome and apologies

Attendees (15): Councillors Mohsin Hussain, Ruth Wood, Peter Clarke, Peter Caffrey, Amanda Parsons-Hulse, Dot Foster, Donald Firth, Yusra Hussain, Anthony Smith, Robert Finnigan, Paul Wray, Sharon Hamilton, Harry Ellis, David Jones (substitute), Stephen Fenton.

Apologies (1): Councillor Jackie Ferguson.

In attendance: Tracy Brabin (Mayor), Dave Pearson, Helen Ellerton, Khaled Berroum, Hannah Scales

### Item 2 – Declarations of Disclosable Pecuniary Interests

None.

### Item 3 – Possible exclusion of the press and public

None.

### Item 4 – Minutes of the meeting held on 18 November 2021

Minutes were agreed as an accurate record.

### Item 5 – Chairs comments and update

The Chair updated Members on the recent meetings of Scrutiny Chairs Steering Group where a system for project scrutiny was discussed, including criteria to prioritise projects for scrutiny in future. The Chairs welcomed any ideas or comments.

The Chair also informed Members of the 'Motorbike Live' event she attended in December and discussed how motorbikes could better be considered in future transport strategising and planning as a possible topic of further enquiry for the committee.

### Item 6 – Transport network and projects update

The Chair briefly introduced the information report and invited Members to ask any questions. Clarification was sought about emergency timetables and reduced bus services and it was explained that the situation was fast-moving there was a possibility of bus companies reducing services due to the decreased patronage if funding was not secured. Updates would be provided when known.

### Item 7 – Transport Scrutiny Work Programme

Members were reminded of the next meeting due to be held on 10 March 2022 and one of the key items being behaviour change, based on the committee's deliberations this year so far.

### Item 8 – Mayor's Question Time, Tracy Brabin

The Chair welcomed and thanked the Mayor Tracy Brabin for attending and outlined the format of the Mayor's Question Time. The session would be split into pre-agreed topic areas and members could ask any questions under those topic areas in turn.

The topic areas were:

- Mayoral and Combined Authority transport powers
- Buses
- Mass Transit and connectivity
- Rail
- Active Travel

Following questions and discussion took place:

- **Mayoral and Combined Authority's powers:** Members noted that although the Mayor had some direct powers, relatively she had more soft power than direct. Mayors across the regions work together through the M8 and M10 groups to pool 'soft power' influence and leverage relationships in parliament and government to influence policy and decisions and secure funding. The Mayor also works alongside the 5 local council leaders and considers herself "one of a group of six" part of a collective approach, as expressed in the CA's governance structure. Members discussed which additional transport powers the Mayor might need going forward such as powers around climate change and electric bus fleet management, as well as possible rail and road powers.
- **Buses:** The FlexiBus ("demand led" bus service) pilot in East Leeds was discussed along with the importance of ensuring access to buses for people in all areas of West Yorkshire. The Mayor outlined how the Bus Service Improvement Plan planned to support West Yorkshire's rural communities, although an announcement on funding for the BSIP was still awaited. It was hoped in the meantime that the Enhanced Partnership would give the Combined Authority more insight and opportunity to influence bus companies to provide a reliable and desirable service.

The government and the Combined Authority supported bus companies during the pandemic to keep services running. The government had yet to announce how funding would continue after March and as a result bus companies are planning ahead, with possible reductions in timetabled services due to uncertainty. The Mayor confirmed she had written to bus operators about this.

It was noted that travel behaviours have changed since the pandemic and long-term impact is still being analysed. The pandemic reduced journeys, but patronage had returned back to approximately 80% of pre-pandemic patronage before the Omicron variant. This means that demand is still there initiatives such as free bus Sunday, the £1 boxing day offer and cheaper summer tickets for young people had helped in that.

Inclusivity in the network was noted as being crucial and Members noted the Network Navigation Project, including real time navigation screens on bus stops across West Yorkshire. Printed timetables (removed as a result of Covid-19) were due to be re-installed. Audio-visual information on all buses and of the telephone contact centre available for people who prefer speaking to a real person regarding buses were other changes. Improvements such as investment in 'tap in, tap out' payment systems, the disparity of pricing across the region and extra bus priority lanes mitigating delays caused by traffic were discussed.

The Mayor acknowledged the challenges in having a network focusing on a core city such as Leeds and Members were informed that Leeds specific transport funding awarded by government 5 years ago was the reason for the seemingly large number of Leeds-focused schemes being delivered compared to the other areas. The mass transit and connectivity plans hoped to bridge current gaps in connecting more areas to the network.

- **Mass Transit:** It was noted that Leeds – and by extension WY as an urban area – was the only city in Europe that doesn't have a mass transit system. Funding for a Mass Transit system was contained within the current government's manifesto and the Combined authority was given £200 million to begin work on this, following consultation and public engagement. It is key that the plan is future proof and that each individual locality had the best mode of transport for the area to enable seamless routes. The proposed mass transit system is going to the CA in March for approval. Members noted that the Mayor had written to ministers to emphasise long term nature of the project and the need for funding commitments so that future mayors and local governments could see it through to completion.
- **Rail:** The cancellation of HS2 and HS3, and its impact on the whole region and Bradford in particular, was discussed and the Mayor explained that she had written to ministers expressing disappointment at the decision and work was underway to assess the full impact and identify mitigations. Region-wide rail station accessibility and inclusivity concerns were discussed as proof of the necessity of investment in rail station infrastructure after years of seeming neglect. The Mayor expressed her support for electrification of the Calder Valley line had written to ministers but had not yet received a response.
- **Active Travel:** The importance of active travel was discussed as being vital to meet climate targets, though it was acknowledged that areas with varying topography can be more challenging to adapt for inclusive active travel. Some members detailed their experience with consultations on transport schemes and discussed the need to incentivise earlier and wider public and member participation in consultations in future. Behaviour change was identified as key to any success in this area and some ideas included investment in pavement markers and safer segregated cycle lanes.

**Next meeting date – 10 March 2022, venue to be confirmed**

This page is intentionally left blank





**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE  
TRANSPORT & INFRASTRUCTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE  
HELD ON THURSDAY, 19 JANUARY 2023 AT CONFERENCE ROOM  
1/2, WELLINGTON HOUSE, 40-50 WELLINGTON STREET, LEEDS, LS1  
2DE**

---

**Present:**

Councillor Stan Bates	Wakefield Council
Councillor Kayleigh Brooks	Leeds City Council
Councillor Ian Cuthbertson	City of York Council
Councillor Jackie Ferguson	Wakefield Council
Councillor Caroline Firth	Bradford Council
Councillor Dot Foster	Calderdale Council
Councillor Jessica Lennox	Leed City Council
Councillor Harry McCarthy	Kirklees Council
Councillor Amanda Parsons-Hulse (Chair)	Calderdale Council
Councillor Andrew Pinnock (Deputy Chair)	Kirklees Council
Councillor Anna Watson	Bradford Council

**In attendance:**

Mayor Tracy Brabin	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Noel Collings	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Dave Haskins	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Rachel Jones	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Dave Pearson	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Hannah Scales	West Yorkshire Combined Authority

**18. Apologies for absence**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Joanne Dodds, Tina Benton, Mark Thompson, Robert Finnigan and Tony Hames.

The meeting was confirmed as quorate, with 11 members present out of 11 needed for quorum.

**19. Declarations of Disclosable Pecuniary Interests**

There were no declarations of disclosable pecuniary interests.

**20. Possible exclusion of the press and public**

There were no items requiring the exclusion of the press and public.

## 21. Minutes of the last meeting held on 17 November 2022

**Resolved:** That the minutes of the meeting held on 17 November 2022 be approved.

## 22. Chair's comments and update

The Committee received a verbal update from the Chair where the Chair welcomed the Mayor and reminded members of the pre-agreed topics and set out the structure of the meeting.

**Resolved:** That the Chair's verbal update be noted.

## 23. Mayor's Question Time

The Chair thanked the Mayor Tracy Brabin and officers for attending Transport Scrutiny to answer the Committee's questions. Officers present to support the Mayor included the Director of Transport Operations & Customer Experience, Director of Transport Delivery & Policy, the Head of Transport Policy, and Head of Energy and Environment Policy.

The session was split into topic areas and members would be able to ask any questions under those topic areas, and any follow ups. The topic areas were *Buses, Rail, Mass Transit, Net Zero & Decarbonisation, and Active Travel*.

### **Buses**

- The Mayor felt she had done everything in her power to support and work with bus companies and services. Bus companies have been supported with Combined Authority money during the pandemic and since, the Mayor ran a bus driver recruitment and training programme alongside operators for 1000 new bus drivers, and future shift proofing.
- Despite this, when the government provided extra funding to companies, after mayoral lobbying, they still withdrew and cut down on routes. The main problem in her view is that bus services are run for profit and will always focus on that, rather than prioritise socially necessary routes, some of which the CA subsidise.
- Bus franchising may be a solution long term, with a goal of having a London-style bus service every 15 minutes for the whole region, but moving towards franchising requires following a very long and expensive statutory process. WYCA intends to make a decision on progressing this before the 2024 elections. The Mayor has lobbied the government to try to shorten the timescale and difficulty. Greater Manchester is still progressing the move to bus franchising 5 years later.
- The importance of accessibility was emphasised while situations where wheelchair users being set behind pushchairs on buses are still common. The Mayor's 'big bus chat' had provided a useful forum as well as 'Message the Mayor' on BBC Radio Leeds and led to some changes such as adjusting speakers at bus stops for the hearing impaired and ensuring better training for both drivers and passengers on using these services.

- There was tension between talking about the failings of the bus services and encouraging more people to use the system, as it is a challenge to persuade people to use a 'broken system'. Services are back at 80% pre-covid levels, the 'Mayor's Fares' scheme pushed it to 84% and 100% for young people. Frustration was expressed at bus companies increasing cheaper fares of £1.80 to £2 following the 'Mayor's Fares' scheme for more profit.
- There had been some improvements in the Real Time Information system, but several elements still needed work such as ensuring the correct information is submitted by bus operators as frequently as needed, to avoid the phenomenon of 'ghost buses', and to work around infrastructure schemes which have disrupted some roads and areas. Work was underway through the Enhanced Partnership to improve this.

### **Rail, Waterways & Freight**

- The cancellation of HS2 had impacted the entire region and the Mayor hoped that despite the disappointment with HS2, the door had not closed on NPR and a through-station in Bradford could be realised in some way. Labour committed to NPR in full for which the Mayor vowed to hold them to account if they are elected. NPR would unlock £30bn worth of economic growth in the region and cannot be discounted.
- The Mayor described TransPennine Express (TPE) as not fit for purpose, her local service was 20-30% cancellations compared to the average 5%, and felt that these TPE cancellations were holding back West Yorkshire, £2m a week worth of losses, and ruining commuters lives by losing them jobs, missing funerals etc. Unlike in London, people don't have an alternative when the service is cancelled, except for very expensive taxi journeys. Despite this, TPE bosses still receive bonuses.
- The Mayor considers rail freight to be a very good way to better support the region's businesses, and carbon targets, but there is a capacity issue as freight trains currently have to share the same tracks as faster trains, leading to them slowing each other down. The country, and region's, waterways were highlighted as a possible asset in terms of freight, East-to-West trade and taking HGVs off the roads. A recent project for an inland port in Leeds was cancelled as it ran out of funding and the scope of the scheme had changed from a port to a batching facility for commercial reasons. The Committee asked for a report on freight and the waterways/port.
- The Mayor discussed the importance of guards on trains, and how helpful speaking to train staff was whilst using the service had been and agreed with the concerns that they may be taken out of service. The seeming lack of health and safety audits done by the companies with regards to overcrowding, children, and suitcases might lead to problems down the road.

### **Mass Transit**

- Leeds is one of few major cities, and West Yorkshire is the biggest metro-region, in the world without a mass transit system. Historically, previous efforts such as the 'SuperTram' did not succeed. There appears to be a strong political will to proceed this time, and funding had been secured. The CA had recruited an interim Mass Transit

Programme Director who worked on the tram in Edinburgh and his department would expand accordingly as time progressed.

- Building mass transit will be an exceptionally lengthy process, and will take the better part of a decade, with an estimated start date of 2028. It will require long-term government backing, and the Mayor sought assurances from both major parties that they would continue to support the scheme. The process is partly long because of the number of corridors that have to be considered, and the possible effect on local areas, and ensuring that the plans have public support for the changes to their communities.
- The CA is working at pace, to go through the process, which was in the very early stages, the comprehensive consultation process, to ensure nothing is missed and full scrutiny of the process is possible. The consultation on the main vision had just been completed. The Outline Business Case Model was expected by Winter 2023 and Spring 2024.
- Mass Transit would be an opportunity to connect communities with no connections currently. It would not exist on its own, but would be directly linked to a future, franchised bus network, and different modes of travel including walking and cycling, as part of a region wide green transport network. The next step of the consultation process would be to consider possible routes and connections, drawing on lessons learned from other exercises such as 'Mayors Big Bus Chat'.
- One of the main reasons for mass transit was to have a clean and green transport system. There was a challenge in that construction would emit carbon, even if the final product would create lower emissions in the long term. There had been a global engagement exercise with suppliers to feed in ideas on how to reduce and take into account 'Scope 3' emissions during construction. This is also considered across the rest of the CA's schemes as carbon emissions are increasingly important.

### **Decarbonisation and Carbon Emissions**

- Concerns were raised at the previous scrutiny committee meeting in November that too many of the CA's infrastructure schemes do not make any or enough of an impact in reducing carbon emissions long term, in particular road building schemes. The Mayor stated that bus routes require road building, and we need to get people on buses long term if carbon ambitions are to be reached. There is a challenge in that carbon emissions are produced by trying to shift to lower carbon alternatives e.g., road building, construction and scrapping cars.
- The analysis of carbon emissions from transport schemes is very complex because of the knock-on effects across the system and connecting areas, which effect officers' ability to monitor how well the CA is achieving. The Transport Committee received carbon impact assessed schemes during decision-making, and work is underway to support the conclusions of the recent pathways work to improve the evidence base and how the CA understands carbon emissions to better support decision making and monitoring in future.
- The Mayor felt a lot more could be done to ensure West Yorkshire was on track to deliver carbon neutrality, which is why she was eager to progress key policy areas such as infrastructure and bus services to support modal shift. She felt there had been success in other non-

transport areas, such as creating over 1000 green jobs for young people, through the green jobs task force, millions continuing to support businesses in 'greening' their processes and lowering their emissions, tens of millions in retrofitting houses. Every area of the Mayor and CA's responsibility now had a climate emergency focus across all areas, including skills and housing.

- Modal shift was key to lowering carbon emissions long term. There were some lesser-known modal shifts which could be considered further such as cars-to-motorcycles, in addition to the more common ones in cycling and walking which the CA has invested in, such as the £2 million into the Leeds City Bike scheme, soon to be seen across the West Yorkshire.

### **Active Travel: Cycling and Walking**

- The Mayor conveyed her condolences to the family of a young woman and child who were killed recently in a tragic road accident on Scott Hall Road in Leeds. Even one road death was too many.
- The Mayor launched low traffic neighbourhoods and a 'walk to school' programme encouraging parents and children to walk to nursery and school. The Mayor emphasised the importance that roads are safe for these families to do so confidently. The safety of cyclists was also emphasised, the Mayor felt cycle lanes with a raised divide were more helpful. The Deputy Mayor for Policing, Alison Lowe, was leading on road safety called 'Vision Zero' to ensure that active travel modes are safe for all to use. Many people had not yet come to terms with the adapted highway code which puts walkers and cyclists above cars.
- Concerns were raised about the protection of cyclists during ongoing road works which disrupt cycle pathways. On one road in Calderdale the only safety measure was a simple sign asking people not to overtake cyclists. Since the bus service is low quality, more people used cars instead of risking cycling. The CA would look further into the issue of the effects of temporary works on existing active travel infrastructure.
- There was a preference for raised separation between road and cycle paths and a lot of work had already been delivered as part of the active travel agenda, with over 33km of segregated cycle ways and 45km of upgraded towpaths and 35km of greenway, 37 walk to school schemes delivered with 20 more on the way and there was more in the pipeline, with additional active travel funding recently secured to develop more.
- There was a place for transport links in planning and development schemes. There were many planning developments which did not take into account transport infrastructure, especially active travel. The Mayor considered the definition of sustainable (and affordable) housing, in her 5,000 homes target, as including transport links such as bus stops and routes, reduction in car parking, and other infrastructure as key components. Transport links were constantly promoted to developers to ensure that they are considered for future communities being built.

### **Resolved:**

- i) That the Mayor, Director of Transport Operations, Director of Transport Policy & Delivery, Head of Energy & Environment Policy,

- and Head of Transport Policy be thanked for attending, and the Committee's feedback and conclusions be considered further.
- ii) That a report on freight, waterways and the Leeds Inland Port scheme be provided to the committee.

#### **24. Transport Scrutiny Work Programme**

The Committee discussed the Work programme for the remainder of the 2022/23 municipal year. The Committee confirmed the agenda for the last committee meeting of the year, on 9 March, would focus on transport consultations, transport in planning, affordable housing, and freight/waterways/inland port. The Committee also discussed and agreed a workshop, to be held on 16 February, to focus on decarbonisation, behaviour change, active travel, and modal shift.

**Resolved:** That the appended 2022/23 Work Programme be amended to include the agreed changes to the agenda of the 9 March 2023 committee meeting and 16 February 2023 workshop.

#### **25. Date of the next meeting - 9 March 2023**

<b>Report to:</b>	Transport and Infrastructure Scrutiny Committee
<b>Date:</b>	1 December 2023
<b>Subject:</b>	<b>Work Programme 2023/24</b>
<b>Director:</b>	Alan Reiss, Chief Operating Officer
<b>Author:</b>	Khaled Berroum, Statutory Scrutiny Officer

## 1. Purpose of this report

- 1.1 To note the current Work Programme.
- 1.2 To consider any additional agenda items, formal referrals to scrutiny, reviews, call in, and any other tasks, issues or matters the Committee resolves to undertake or consider further.

## 2. Information

### Work Programme 2023/24

- 2.1 The Work Programme is set at the beginning of the year and considered at each meeting where it can be amended and changed as the year progresses. It outlines the work the Committee has agreed to undertake, investigate, and focus on in the municipal year (June 2023 – June 2024) within the resources, remit, and powers available.
- 2.2 The Work Programme was decided over the summer following an initial work planning meeting between Members in July, and subsequent discussions between the Scrutiny Chairs, Scrutiny Members, scrutiny officers and the lead directors and officers for each committee. During discussions, amongst other things, they considered:
  - The Committee's remit and terms of reference
  - Combined Authority's main strategic priorities and the Mayors Pledges
  - The committee's work last year and what should be rolled over
  - Major ongoing and upcoming challenges for West Yorkshire residents
  - Members' areas of expertise and interests
  - The number of meetings: three, excluding Mayors Question Time, each being two hours long
- 2.3 The joint work programme (as of the date of publication), including the other two scrutiny committees, is attached as **Appendix 1**.

### **Referrals to scrutiny**

- 2.4 Under Scrutiny Standing Order 7, any CA Scrutiny Member, any Combined Authority Member, or any elected Member of a West Yorkshire council (or the City of York Council) may formally refer a matter to a scrutiny committee for consideration. The referral must be in writing to the Statutory Scrutiny Officer. The relevant scrutiny committee must then consider and discuss the referral and respond to the referrer explaining whether or not it will consider the matter further and why.
- 2.5 There are no formal referrals for this committee to consider at this meeting.

### **Key decisions and call in**

- 2.6 Scrutiny members may call in any decision of the Mayor, Combined Authority, a decision-making committee, and any key decisions taken by an officer (with the exception of urgent decisions). Key decisions are defined as any decision incurring a financial cost or saving of £1 million or more, or a decision likely to have a significant effect on two or more wards.
- 2.7 Decision-makers (both committees and officers) have two days to publish notice of a decision, at which point scrutiny members have five working days to decide whether to call in the decision, delaying its implementation, and formally requiring the decision maker to reconsider. The call-in process is outlined Section 14 of the Scrutiny Standing Orders.
- 2.8 Any five members of a scrutiny Committee – including at least one member from two different constituent councils (West Yorkshire) – may call-in a decision by notifying the Statutory Scrutiny Officer in writing by 4.00 pm on the fifth working day following publication of a decision notice. The relevant scrutiny chair must then decide whether to approve the call-in and delay the implementation of the decision, after which the committee has 14 days to meet, scrutinise the decision and make any recommendations. Further information is set out in Scrutiny Standing Order 14.
- 2.9 The latest key decisions and forward plans of key decisions are published and available for viewing on the [key decisions section of the Combined Authority's website](#).

### **Changes in membership**

- 2.10 Since the last meeting, no changes to memberships have occurred.

### **Actions for the Statutory Scrutiny Officer**

- 2.11 As outlined in Scrutiny Standing Order 17, the statutory scrutiny officer provides support to a scrutiny committee's work programme and all scrutiny members in exercising their scrutiny duties and fulfilling their objectives.



## **Other matters**

2.12 Please note that the committee meeting originalled scheduled for 22 March 2024 has been brought forward a week to the 15 March in order to avoid the pre-election period.

### **3. Tackling the Climate Emergency Implications**

3.1 There are no climate emergency implications directly arising from this report.

### **4. Inclusive Growth Implications**

4.1 There are no inclusive growth implications directly arising from this report.

### **5. Equality and Diversity Implications**

5.1 There are no equality and diversity implications directly arising from this report.

### **6. Financial Implications**

6.1 There are no financial implications directly arising from this report.

### **7. Legal Implications**

7.1 There are no legal implications directly arising from this report.

### **8. Staffing Implications**

8.1 There are no staffing implications directly arising from this report.

### **9. External Consultees**

9.1 No external consultations have been undertaken.

### **10. Recommendations**

10.1 That the Committee notes or amends the Work Programme.

10.2 That the rearrangement of the 22 March committee meeting to the 15 March be noted.

### **11. Background Documents**

[Scrutiny Standing Orders](#)

[Key Decisions Forward Plan \(as of this month\)](#)

### **12. Appendices**

Appendix 1 – Joint Scrutiny Work Programme (as of the date of publication)

This page is intentionally left blank

## Scrutiny Work Programmes 2023/24

### Summary of main topics and meeting dates

Committee	Main topic areas	Meetings
<b>Corporate</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Corporate performance monitoring</li> <li>• Budget, finances and resources (incl staff capacity)</li> <li>• ‘Deeper devolution’</li> <li>• Decision making and governance</li> <li>• Projects: ICS, Wellington House refurbishment, MCA Digital Programme, Procurement and social value</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 22 September 2023</li> <li>• 24 November 2023</li> <li>• 19 January 2024 (Mayors Questions)</li> <li>• 8 March 2024 (PM)</li> </ul>
<b>Transport &amp; Infrastructure</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Bus franchising and service improvement (incl BSIP+)</li> <li>• Mass Transit</li> <li>• Strategy, policy and Local Transport Plan 4 pre-scrutiny</li> <li>• Performance monitoring of transport network, bus services, passenger experience and transport projects</li> <li>• Housing (achievement of mayoral pledge)</li> <li>• Projects: Flexi Bus</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 29 September 2023</li> <li>• 1 December 2023 (Mayors Question)</li> <li>• 26 January 2024</li> <li>• 15 March 2024</li> </ul>
<b>Economy</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Economic outlook/data</li> <li>• Economic strategy development: strategic challenges, current / future challenges</li> <li>• Adult Education Budget and adult learning</li> <li>• School engagement, apprenticeships and youth learning</li> <li>• Approach to business support and investment, including culture / creative industries</li> <li>• Economics services performance/outputs monitoring</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 15 September 2023</li> <li>• 17 November 2023</li> <li>• 12 January 2024 (Mayors Questions)</li> <li>• 8 March 2024</li> </ul>

25

## Corporate Scrutiny Committee

Topic	Sub-topics/focuses	Date
Strategic focus and performance monitoring	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>How is performance monitored – how does the process work? (Who monitors it? What data is collected and how is it presented?)</li> <li>Logic and assumptions behind deciding the actual KPI/target/objective numbers; evidence based, need based, capacity based? Is it 'arbitrary'?</li> <li>Focus on long term progression 'journey of delivery' for greater context – past KPIs, current, future.</li> <li>What impact is the CA actually making? What 'levers' does it actually have? Is there proof of 'additionality'?</li> <li>Strategic alignments: Region-first thinking, avoiding local parochialism; Levelling up within WY vs Leeds centricity (inclusion in KPIs and performance monitoring of it?); Competition between districts and in district priorities (especially in bidding)?</li> </ul>	22 September 2023  8 March 2024 (possibly returning the item)
Budget and resources (including staff capacity)	<p><u>Budget and finances:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Usual budget monitoring and pre-scrutiny.</li> <li>Gainshare spending + Gateway Review 2023/2024.</li> <li>Reserves policy/level – Audit's view of risks and viability.</li> <li>Corporate borrowing – possibility, rules, amount.</li> <li>Revenue raising and additional sources of funding.</li> <li>Use of past data to contextualise current budget against past budgets and future projected budgets.</li> </ul> <p><u>Staff capacity:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Does the organisation have the staff to deliver? Pressures between efficiency savings (e.g. vacancy management, lower pay awards in competitive market) and delivery capacity.</li> <li>Recruitment and retention challenges in local government – what are the areas of concern, what can be done, where can the five authorities work together (e.g. pooling resources).</li> <li>Progress and changes since the last staff survey analysis (and historic context).</li> </ul>	24 November 2023 (+ Gateway Review as separate item)  December 2023 (workshop)  19 January 2024 (possible update)  8 March (update – possibly including focus on staff)
Deeper devolution	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Current status of promised powers that have not yet been devolved e.g. planning. (Autumn update?)</li> <li>Future expected further devolution, including 'single settlement' funding model.</li> </ul>	TBC – after government announcements
Decision making and governance.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Governance rules and structure etc.</li> <li>How are decisions made – from the origin point (inception) of an idea (or need) to policy/service development, to scrutiny/discussion, to decision, to monitoring delivery, to evaluation.</li> </ul>	22 September 2023 (Assurance Framework)

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Role of members and level of control and influence over process.</li> <li>• Role of officers and internal decision-making structures – when do officers decide, when do members decide.</li> <li>• How each stage is communicated to stakeholders (members, public) and how they are involved.</li> <li>• The Assurance Framework and role of PAT in project decisions/management/scrutiny/evaluation etc.</li> <li>• Scrutiny system.</li> </ul>	<p>element and project decision-making)</p> <p>TBC – other elements, possibly after/alongside deeper devolution item following government announcements</p>
Project: Integrated Corporate System (ICS)	Update on progress since last year.	TBC – Chair to receive briefing and suggest way forward
Project: Wellington House refurbishment	Post-project Evaluations report.	TBC – Chair to receive briefing and suggest way forward
Project: MCA Digital Programme	Briefing on project and progress.	TBC – Chair to receive briefing and suggest way forward
Project: Procurement and social value	Update from last year: methodology, risks, real value.	TBC – Chair to receive briefing and suggest way forward

## Transport & Infrastructure Scrutiny Committee

Topic	Sub-topics/focuses	Date
Bus reform and improvement	<p>Overview of long-term bus reform plans (Franchising) and short-term efforts to improve bus services in the meantime (BSIP, etc)</p> <p>Long term reforms – Bus franchising:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Background and update on bus franchising and upcoming consultation (<i>to be approved at 28 Sept CA meeting, held the day before TSC</i>)</li> </ul> <p>Short term improvements – BSIP update and performance:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Update/changes in BSIP since 2021/22 (<i>when the committee last looked at it</i>)</li> <li>• Most updated quarterly report and KPIs – including update on RTI accuracy (<i>considered by committee last Sept</i>).</li> <li>• Bus network performance and passenger experience data</li> </ul> <p>Areas of interest:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Current bus service / operator performance issues</li> <li>- Effects of service cuts and possible solutions</li> <li>- Public engagement, customer service quality re complaints, consultations and service changes</li> </ul>	<p>22 September 2023 – Overview, background and update (ahead of bus franchising consultation)</p> <p>26 January 2024 – Further update on franchising consultation and BSIP</p> <p>TBC – look at consultation report and results before March 2024 final approval</p>
Mass Transit	<p>Overview of the background to the scheme, level of funding, short term and long term timelines, main challenges, legal questions, type of systems being considered, whether it is future proof, public consultation, level of connectivity</p>	<p>26 January 2024</p> <p>Any further update based on timelines</p>
Overview and Monitoring – transport services and projects/schemes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• KPI, projects, objectives – performance and achievement.</li> <li>• Understand transport schemes, funding/bidding, strategic and ROI criteria, impact assessments on non-transport areas.</li> </ul>	<p>29 September 2023 – buses/passenger experience</p> <p>26 January 2024</p>
Strategy/policy and Local Transport Plan 4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Decarbonisation (and government assessment toolkit)</li> <li>• Behaviour Change and Active Travel (including bikes, e-bikes/e-scooters, and motorbikes)</li> <li>• Freight and waterways as a resource</li> <li>• Current and future transport trends; the pandemic and beyond (bus/rail footfall, homeworking positives vs rise in deliveries)</li> </ul>	<p>15 March 2024</p> <p>(LTP4 consultation in Summer 2024, for adoption in 2025)</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Infrastructure, energy and sustainability challenges and opportunities of future proof transport system (electricity demand vs sources, lithium dependency and mining, effect on other industries and sectors)]</li> <li>• Pollution, health and clean air zones</li> </ul>	
Housing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Achievement of 'affordable' and 'sustainable' targets</li> <li>• Challenges and solutions (target vs need in region)</li> <li>• Available funding and what it is being spent on</li> </ul>	TBC
Projects: Flexi Bus	Review July Transport Cttee report and reason for non-viability and early termination, and circumstances of decision	TBC – workshop

## Economy Scrutiny Committee

Topic	Sub-topics/focuses	Dates
Economic outlook and strategic challenges	<p><u>Current situation/data:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Latest data and economic outlook since last year e.g. economic figures, inflation, cost of living effects</li> <li>• Any comparisons with neighbouring regions with overlapping economic footprints e.g. NY and GM.</li> </ul> <p><u>Current/persistent challenges:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Continuing post-pandemic challenges: effects on town centres / hospitality businesses and plans to deal with this (e.g. shopfront grants, cultural exhibitions, IT/study areas); changes in work habits and effects of people being able to work remotely on local economies and other areas.</li> <li>• Persistent economic challenges: NEETs, people 'missing' from data, part time work trends, over-50s/retirees returning to work, green sector/skills growth and preparation, manufacturing in need of support, inter-regional imbalances in economic growth/jobs within WY, and retention of talent within WY.</li> </ul> <p><u>New/Future challenges:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• AI, automation, green/decarbonisation (+ any other disruptions?) which have accelerated recently and their potential consequences on the regional economy, businesses and jobs.</li> <li>• Are we prepared for these challenges? Can we get ahead of other MCAs/areas and position ourselves as leaders in these emerging markets?</li> <li>• Potential conflict between productivity/growth/tech advancement vs job creation/community/place/diversity considerations.</li> </ul> <p><u>Economic Strategy update:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How we are addressing the above challenges through the economic strategy + current thinking/progress + timeline for finalisation and adoption</li> </ul>	<p>15 September 2023 – intro and main discussion</p> <p>8 March 2024 – update on economic strategy</p>
Adult Education Budget, Schools and Training Providers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Update on last year's AEB performance and this year's spending and outputs.</li> <li>• School engagement and young people opportunities and apprenticeships</li> <li>• Apprenticeships and non-university career routes</li> </ul>	17 November 2023
Business investment and outcomes (including culture + creative industries) and	<p><u>Business investment:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How we are investing in businesses and generating outcomes</li> </ul> <p><u>Culture and creative industries:</u></p>	8 March 2024



performance monitoring/outputs/funding	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• A mayoral objective, an increasing percentage of the region's economy and upcoming/recent city of culture events (in Bradford and Leeds)</li></ul> <p><u>Performance monitoring and KPIs</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Monitoring achievement of economy targets/KPIs from the corporate plan.</li><li>• "Follow the money": where is funding coming from, how is it spent, what are the revenue opportunities.</li><li>• Inter-regional levelling up, avoidance of Leeds-centricity, ensuring certain areas/towns are not forgotten, place-based element of targets/KPIs e.g. number of jobs/houses/businesses supported in different districts</li></ul>	
--	--	--

This page is intentionally left blank